Case 1:00-cv-01898-VSB Document 2594 Filed 07/06/09 Page 1 of 3

SHIRA A. SCHEINDLIN, U.S.D.J.:

-----X

Defendant moves to join the New York City Water Board Authority and the New York City Municipal Water Finance Authority to this action because, in their absence, "the court cannot accord complete relief among existing parties." Defendant argues that these entities have reimbursed the City for past costs related

Fed. R. Civ. P. 19(a)(1)(A).

to this litigation and may have an interest in collecting from defendant any costs for water projects that the City fails to recover in this litigation. The City does not object to joining these entities as parties. The trial begins in less than three weeks. The Water Board and the Water Finance Agency are therefore ordered to join this action as party plaintiffs.² The Clerk of the Court is ordered to amend the caption. Council for the City has represented that it will also represent these additional plaintiffs who will be referred to collectively as "the City."

SO ORDERED:

Shira A. Scheindlin

U.Š.D.J.

Dated:

New York, New York

July 6, 2009

-Appearances-

Counsel for Plaintiff City of New York:

Victor M. Sher, Esq. Sher Leff LLP 450 Mission Street, Suite 400 San Francisco, California 94105 (415) 348-1568

Susan Amron Assistant Corporation Counsel 100 Church Street New York, New York 10007 (212) 788-1568

Counsel for ExxonMobil:

Peter John Sacripanti, Esq. James A. Pardo, Esq. McDermott Will & Emery LLP 340 Madison Avenue New York, New York 10173 (212) 547-5583